

An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion in the Brazilian Labor Market

CRITICAL MANAGEMENT STUDIES

The *Critical Management Studies* series covers topics from management style techniques, corporate culture and cross-cultural management to evaluation, organizational structure and management science and operations, drawing on a range of radical traditions that include feminism, critical theory, Marxism, post-modernism/poststructuralism, critical race theory, environmentalism, labor process theory, postcolonial theory, existentialism, and applied critical management studies.

Books in this series aim to contribute to sociopolitical change, from authors who self-identify as critical management scholars, critical scholars of management, or those with practical experience in the field, encouraging us to rethink the fundamental relationships between working/organizing/managing and our sense of humanity.

Previous books:

Organizing Disaster: The Construction of Humanitarianism

Written by: Adam Rostis

Organization Theory: Critical and Philosophical Engagements

Written by: Tuomo Peltonen

Contesting Institutional Hegemony in Today's Business Schools: Doctoral Students Speak Out

Edited by: Ajnesh Prasad

The Ideological Evolution of Human Resource Management: A Critical Look into HRM Research and Practices

Written by: Sami Itani

Making Critical Sense of Immigrant Experience: A Case Study of Hong Kong Chinese in Canada

Written by: Rosalie K.S. Hilde

STEM-Professional Women's Exclusion in the Canadian Space Industry: Anchor Points and Intersectionality at the Margins of Space

Written by: Stefanie Ruel

Values, Rationality, and Power: Developing Organizational Wisdom: A Case Study of a Canadian Healthcare Authority

Written by: Brad C. Anderson

Historical Female Management Theorists: Frances Perkins, Hallie Flanagan, Madeleine Parent, Viola Desmond

Written by: Kristin S. Williams

An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion in the Brazilian Labor Market

BY

CAMILLA PINTO LUNA

University of Grande Rio, Brazil

AND

DENISE FRANCA BARROS

University of Grande Rio, Brazil



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2023

Copyright © 2023 Camilla Pinto Luna and Denise Franca Barros.
Published under exclusive license by Emerald Publishing Limited.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83753-153-0 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-83753-152-3 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-83753-154-7 (Epub)



ISOQAR certified
Management System,
awarded to Emerald
for adherence to
Environmental
standard
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

Contents

| | |
|---|--------------|
| List of Figures and Tables | <i>vii</i> |
| List of Abbreviations and Acronyms | <i>ix</i> |
| About the Authors | <i>xiii</i> |
| Preface | <i>xv</i> |
| Acknowledgements | <i>xvii</i> |
| Abstract | <i>xviii</i> |
| | |
| Chapter 1 Introduction | <i>1</i> |
| Research Relevance and Contributions | <i>6</i> |
| Research Delimitation | <i>8</i> |
| | |
| Chapter 2 Violence and Resistance: Understanding Issues Situated (Not Limited) to Brazil | <i>11</i> |
| | |
| Chapter 3 A Discussion about Performativity, Transsexuality, and Organizations | <i>21</i> |
| Gender Performativity | <i>21</i> |
| Transsexuality | <i>23</i> |
| Transsexuality, Prejudice, Exclusion, and Organizations | <i>24</i> |
| Institutionalized Transphobia | <i>27</i> |
| Performativity, ANTi-History, and Gender | <i>31</i> |
| | |
| Chapter 4 The ANTi-History as Theoretical Lens and Methodological Approach | <i>35</i> |
| Historical Turn in Organizational Studies: The Origin of the Call | <i>35</i> |
| ANTi-History as Theoretical Lens | <i>37</i> |
| ANTi-History as Methodological Approach | <i>40</i> |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Procedures for Data Collection | 43 |
| Preparation of Network Diagrams | 50 |
| Chapter 5 ANTi-History and Rhizome: Unveiling a Socio Past in Layers | 53 |
| Chapter 6 The Beginning of this Version: The Trans Body as a Material Property Conservated by the Brazilian State | 57 |
| Chapter 7 Toward the Guarantee of Fundamental Rights: Sociopolitical (Trans)Formations in Brazil | 63 |
| Chapter 8 (Re)Assembling a Normative Course: Right to Health, Depathologization of Transsexuality and Recognition of “Employable People” | 73 |
| Chapter 9 Mobilizations and Demobilizations of Trans Employability in Motion | 87 |
| Chapter 10 The End of this Version: Layers of a Rhizome Network | 95 |
| Reassembling a Recent Past: Diversity Policies in Organizations | 97 |
| Chapter 11 Final Considerations | 105 |
| Implications Research and ESG | 107 |
| Conclusion | 109 |
| Epilogue: Ongoing and Future Research | 109 |
| Appendix 1: List of Data Sources | 111 |
| Appendix 2: Data Collected in the Transempregos Vacancies Bank | 125 |
| References | 177 |
| Index | 193 |

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| Fig. 1. | Diagram of the Socio Past (Re)Assembly Process. | 43 |
| Fig. 2. | Organization and Storage of Research Collection. | 47 |
| Fig. 3. | Network Rhizome Diagram (First Layer). | 60 |
| Fig. 4. | Network Rhizome Diagram (Second Layer). | 71 |
| Fig. 5. | Network Rhizome Diagram (Third Layer). | 86 |
| Fig. 6. | Network Rhizome Diagram (Fourth Layer). | 94 |
| Fig. 7. | Network Rhizome Diagram with Overlapping Layers. | 97 |
| Fig. 8. | Trans Employability Map in Brazil. | 100 |
| Fig. 9. | Distribution Graph of Job Offers by State. | 101 |

Tables

| | | |
|----------|--|----|
| Table 1. | Data Collection Strategies. | 44 |
| Table 2. | Strategy A: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection. | 45 |
| Table 3. | Strategy B: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection. | 48 |
| Table 4. | Strategy C: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection. | 49 |

This page intentionally left blank

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

| | |
|--------|---|
| ABGLT | Associação Brasileira de Gays, Bissexuais, Lésbicas, Travestis e Transexuais [Brazilian Association of Gays, Bisexuals, Lesbians, Transvestites and Transsexuals] |
| ABHT | Associação Brasileira de Homens Trans [Brazilian Association of Trans Men] |
| ABRAT | Associação Brasileira de Transgêneros [Brazilian Transgender Association] |
| AIDS | Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| ANT | Actor-Network Theory |
| ANTRA | Associação Nacional de Travestis e Transexuais [National Association of Transvestites and Transsexuals] |
| ASTRAL | Associação das Travestis e Liberados [Association of Transvestites and Liberated] |
| ATRAS | Associação das Travestis de Salvador [Salvador Transvestites Association] |
| BBC | British Broadcasting Corporation |
| CCJ | Comissão de Constituição de Justiça [Justice Constitution Commission] |
| CEP | Comitês de Ética em Pesquisa [Research Ethics Committees] |
| CFM | Conselho Federal de Medicina [Federal Council of Medicine] |
| CIT | Comissão Intergestores Tripartite [Tripartite Interagency Committee] |
| CLAM | Centro Latino-Americano em Sexualidade e Direitos Humanos [Latin American Center on Sexuality and Human Rights] |
| CMS | Critical Management Studies |
| CNS | Conferência Nacional de Saúde [National Health Conference] |

x List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

| | |
|-----------|---|
| CONEP | Comissão Nacional de Ética em Pesquisa [National Research Ethics Commission] |
| CONITEC | Comissão Nacional de Incorporação de Tecnologias no SUS [National Commission for the Incorporation of Technologies in SUS] |
| COVID-19 | Coronavirus Disease 2019 |
| CREMESP | Conselho Regional de Medicina do Estado de São Paulo [Regional Council of Medicine of the State of São Paulo] |
| CRM-MG | Conselho Regional de Medicina – Minas Gerais [Regional Council of Medicine – Minas Gerais] |
| CRM-PR | Conselho Regional de Medicina – Paraná [Regional Council of Medicine – Paraná] |
| CRM-SC | Conselho Regional de Medicina – Santa Catarina [Regional Council of Medicine – Santa Catarina] |
| CRM-SP | Conselho Regional de Medicina – São Paulo [Regional Council of Medicine – São Paulo] |
| DEGRAN | Departamento das Delegacias Regionais de Polícia da Grande São Paulo [Department of Regional Police Stations of Greater São Paulo] |
| ENCM | Encontro Nacional dos Conselhos de Medicina [National Meeting of Medical Councils] |
| ENTLAIDS | Encontro Nacional de Travestis e Liberados que Atuam na Prevenção da Aids [National Meeting of Transvestites and Liberals who Work in the Prevention of AIDS] |
| ESG | Environmental, Social, and Corporate Governance |
| FMUSP | Hospital de Clínicas da Faculdade de Medicina [Clinical Hospital of the Faculty of Medicine] |
| FONATRANS | Fórum Nacional de Travestis e Transexuais Negras e Negros [National Forum of Black and Black Transvestites and Transsexuals] |
| FPE | Frente Parlamentar Evangélica [Evangelical Parliamentary Front of the Brazilian National Congress] |
| FURG | Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo [Federal University of Espírito Santo] |
| GABLE | Gay, Ally, Bisexual, Lesbian and Transgender Employees (Procter & Gamble) |
| GGB | Grupo Gay da Bahia [Bahia Gay Group] |
| HIV | Human Immunodeficiency Virus |
| HUPE | Hospital Universitário Pedro Ernesto [Pedro Ernesto University Hospital] |

| | |
|------------|---|
| IACHR | Inter-American Commission on Human Rights |
| IBGE | Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística [Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics] |
| IBRAT | Instituto Brasileiro de Transmasculinidades [Brazilian Institute of Transmasculinities] |
| IBTE | Instituto Brasileiro Trans de Educação [Trans Brazilian Institute of Education] |
| ICD | International Classification of Diseases |
| ILGA WORLD | The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association |
| IMS | Instituto de Medicina Social [Institute of Social Medicine] |
| ISER | Instituto Superior de Estudos da Religião [Higher Institute of Religious Studies] |
| LGBTQIA+ | Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transsexual/Transgender, Queer, Intersexual, Asexual, all other diversities and pluralities of sexual orientation or gender identity that exist |
| MDG | Millennium Development Goals |
| MECMPAS | Instituto de Psiquiatria da Fundação Faculdade de Medicina [Psychiatry Institute of Faculty-Foundation of Medicine] |
| MOS | Management and Organizational Studies |
| MPDFT | Ministério Público do Distrito Federal [Federal District Public Ministry] |
| MPF | Ministério Público Federal [Federal Public Ministry] |
| MPSP | Ministério Público do Estado de São Paulo [Public Ministry of the State of São Paulo] |
| NAHT | Núcleo de Apoio a Homens Trans [Support Center for Trans Men] |
| NGO | Non-Governmental Organization |
| OAB | Ordem dos Advogados do Brasil [Brazilian Bar Association] |
| OMS | Organizational Memory Studies |
| PUC-Rio | Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro [Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro] |
| PUC-SP | Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo [Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo] |
| RENATA | Rede Nacional de Travestis [National Transvestite Network] |
| RENTAL | Rede Nacional de Travestis e Liberados [National Network of Transvestites and Liberated People] |

xii List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

| | |
|-----------|--|
| SDG | Sustainable Development Goals |
| SEJUR/CFM | Setor Jurídico do Conselho Federal de Medicina [Legal Sector of the Federal Council of Medicine] |
| SINAN | Sistema de Informação de Agravos de Notificação [Notification Grievances Information System] |
| SOGIE | Sexual Orientation or Gender Identity and Expression |
| STD | Sexually Transmitted Diseases |
| STF | Supremo Tribunal Federal [Federal Court of Justice] |
| SUDS | Sistemas Unificados e Descentralizados de Saúde nos Estados [Unified and Decentralized Health Systems in the States] |
| SUS | Sistema Único de Saúde [Health Unic System] |
| TGEU | Transgender Europe |
| TJSP | Tribunal de Justiça do Estado de São Paulo [Court of Justice of the State of São Paulo] |
| TMM | Trans Murder Monitoring |
| TRF | Tribunal Regional Federal [Federal Regional Court] |
| UERJ | Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro [State University of Rio de Janeiro] |
| UFES | Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo [Federal University of Espírito Santo] |
| UFG | Universidade Federal de Goiás [Goiás Federal University] |
| UFMG | Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais [Minas Gerais Federal University] |
| UFRGS | Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul [Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul] |
| UNIDAS | Associação de Travestis Unidas na Luta pela Cidadania [Association of Transvestites United in the Fight for Citizenship] |
| USP | Universidade de São Paulo [University of Sao Paulo] |
| WHO | World Health Organization |

About the Authors

Camilla Pinto Luna holds a Ph.D. in Management (2021), Master in Management (2017) from the University of Grande Rio (PPGA – UNIGRANRIO), and Specialist in Public Administration by IAVM, Cândido Mendes University (2011). Luna graduated in Business from the State University of Rio de Janeiro – UERJ (2009); is Administrator at the Federal University of the State of Rio de Janeiro (UNIRIO); and is member of two research groups at UNIGRANRIO, a group focused on studies of gender, sexuality, work, and consumption and another group on critical studies in organizational studies. Luna's research interest is in organizational studies, historical approaches in management, and gender studies.

Denise Franca Barros holds a Ph.D. in Management (2011) and a Master in Public Administration and Management (2006) from EBAPE-FGV, Rio de Janeiro). Barros previously worked at Unigranrio – University of Grande Rio, Fundação Getulio Vargas (EBAPE-FGV, Rio de Janeiro) and Escola Superior de Propaganda e Marketing (ESPM – Rio).

This page intentionally left blank

Preface

It is not news that we discuss issues about power relations in discourse, reflecting on which voices have space for speech and which are marginalized and often silenced (seeing the works of Bourdieu, Foucault, and Butler). However, it seems that the expression *place of speech* has become popular here in Brazil very recently, and, despite being present in several discussions, many people still do not understand for sure what it is. At least, this is my experience in forums, meetings, conferences, and conversations with colleagues and friends. Some people can explain the topic in greater depth, such as Djamila Ribeiro – Brazilian, feminist, philosopher, writer (I even recommend this source to anyone who wants to understand the place of speech better). However, briefly, I would say that when we talk about the place of speech, we are arguing about social issues that impact different spaces and organizations (whether political, cultural, or intellectual) and that limit and make individualized aspects of the experiences invisible because some of these voices were silenced since individuals were excluded from these spaces.

But why am I talking about this?

Because many of you are reading this work, upon seeing the title, you must have wondered if I am a trans woman (by the way, answering the question, I am not).

Then, other questions will probably arise (Why did you choose to talk about this topic? How did you get to it? Can you talk about it? Do you want to speak in place of a trans?).

I am uncomfortable with a reality where people do not have the same opportunities or possibilities. So why wouldn't I stay?! Looking around and seeing that certain problems belong to everyone is very important for us to start thinking about solutions. Using the words of Professor Luiz Alex Saraiva (2016):

[...] we live in dangerous blindness to everything that does not affect us personally. Only when this unspeakable violence comes close to we know does it seem to concern us. We lose empathy, the ability to put ourselves in the other's shoes to see the suffering of others as somehow close to ourselves for the sake of humanity. (p. 762)

All this to be able to say that I feel uncomfortable with social exclusion – for me, my history, and others. Once again, quoting the words of Professor Luiz Alex, in a free translation from the original:

I am with all those who fight for a collective cause, who do not hide under corrosive individualism. I deeply regret the victims of an order that denies difference. (Saraiva, 2016, p. 772)

My perception of the possibilities of management and organizations goes beyond something that only occurs within corporations, and it is not new that I am interested in researching gender issues (a theme I have been working on for years). The relationship between the management area and society is clear to me, added to an experience that is part of the nature of exclusion.

Today, as an administrator and researcher in Administration, I have a place where I can talk about certain aspects, but I recognize that many others are not within my competence. Therefore, it is important to clarify that I do not intend to speak for a transgender person. I do not want to try to convey the perspective or experience of a transgender person. I do not occupy this place of speech. But I want to make other researchers in Administration, future managers, or current managers reflect on this issue. I want to address the different forms of social exclusion, gender identity prejudice, inequality, and role inclusion policies, citizenship, and guaranteed access to education, leisure, health, and work.

So, for this reason, I chose to bring to this book an important social issue that is still silent in the area. I did that seeking to draw attention to the problem and a change, however small it is. Furthermore, if your biggest question when reading the title of this work was: *Is the author trans?* – it might be very interesting that you keep reading the content and try to understand how this is everyone's problem.

Camilla Pinto Luna

Acknowledgements

First, we would like to thank Gabrielle Durepos for being part of our path, for the encouragement for this project, and all the generosity. Gabie, you inspired us and this is something beyond words.

We thank the editorial team and the reviewers for your kind attention and suggestions, which we believe were crucial for improving our work.

We would also like to thank the Emerald team for seriousness and commitment to work. Especially, Albert Mills for kindness and for all the guidelines. As well as Fiona Allison for the promptness and feedback.

Finally, we want to thank all those researchers and colleagues who contributed throughout our trajectory, even whose names were not mentioned here.

Abstract

Brazil is a country with the highest rate of trans people murders and a scenario where most of these people are in conditions of misery and social exclusion, without access to health, education, and labor. Recently, we observed a movement of organizations seeking to promote the employability of transgender people in the country. This scenario is not built from isolated events that occur today, but it reflects relationships that were built over time. This past is full of events that can be considered advances and setbacks arising from associations between people, initiatives, regulations, organizations, and other actors that intervene in this regard. Thereby, this study seeks to investigate sociopolitical relations of actors-network highlighting the main mobilizations and demobilizations in the trajectory of employability of transgender people in organizations in Brazil. For this, we resorted to ANTi-History as a theoretical and methodological approach, which is historically informed by the Actor-Network Theory and was developed in Management and Organization Studies in order to allow us to understand the phenomenon through a unique and retrospective lens. The analysis of this research (re)assembles a version of history about the observed phenomenon and brings a network rhizome that involves a multiplicity of actors and their relations over time. This implies rescuing memories in the transgender–society–labor market relationship, as well as revealing a broader context that surrounds recent employability initiatives and silencing around this matter.

Keywords: ANTi-History; transgender; organizations; employability; work; Transphobia

Chapter 1

Introduction

Recently, we have noticed a movement of certain organizations regarding initiatives to include transgender people in formal work relationships. These movements are taking place through the elaboration or adoption of actions, programs, and policies arising from the management of public and private organizations. It is possible to verify this through, for example, the indices on the *Transempregos* website (focused on the inclusion of trans professionals in the labor market) – which in the year 2014 had only 12 companies using its services, but currently 46 partner companies are using its services (Lima, 2018).

It is also possible to notice the change in this scenario through the diversity and inclusion actions that are taking place in large corporations, such as IBM (International Business Machines) (https://www.ibm.com/impact/be-equal/pdf/IBM_Diversity_Inclusion_Report_2020.pdf) – which has a diversity leader in the team; Procter&Gamble – which features a company group titled GABLE (Gay, Ally, Bisexual, Lesbian, and Transgender Employees) to discuss LGBTQI+ issues (<https://www.pgcareers.com/GABLE>); Carrefour – with the support of the *Conexão Varejo* project, of the NGO *Rede Cidadã* and the hiring of trans people (<https://www.grupocarrefourbrasil.com.br/carrefour-promove-acao-especial-para-contratacao-de-pessoas-trans/>); and Pernod Ricard – which, in partnership with NGOs, offers free bartending courses for transsexuals (Lima, 2018).

The reasons may not be altruistic. Consulting surveys show that, on average, companies with plural teams perform 57% better than the industry in general, involving issues of organizational climate, employee engagement, productivity, and innovation (Lima, 2018). In addition, many of the companies are possibly trying to reach and attract potential consumers and employees who connect with the LGBTQIA+ cause (Lima, 2018).

At this point, it is also worth considering that even companies that are LGBTQIA+ friendly focus more on LGB than on TQIA+ (Ozturk & Tatli, 2016), and despite a growing global awareness of the struggles trans people face, many employers are unaware of these challenges (Thoroughgood et al., 2020). The awareness, understanding, and acceptance of the general public of trans people have increased in the last decade; however, the stigma surrounding trans people is still widespread, which leads to structural discrimination in society

2 An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion

(Cipriakis et al., 2020). Thus, these initiatives encompass an undermost portion of the social problem related to the inclusion of trans people in the formal labor market. ANTRA data show that only 4% of transvestites and transsexual women are in formal jobs (Benevides & Aguiar, 2019).

The issue of transsexuality has gained greater prominence in recent decades mainly due to the regulation of assistance programs in public health, thus causing a movement to reflect on ethical, bioethical, legal, and social issues (Arán, 2006). After a slow process full of resistance fighting for space and recognition of rights, the LGBTQIA+ population has achieved some advances in relation to transsexuality. Including the growth in the number of countries that are adopting gender-legal recognition policies and the increase of the issuance of official documents in which a specific gender identification is not indicated.¹ In this, we see examples such as the first Trans Pride event that took place in 2013 in Brighton, England (Stonewall, 2017); the case of the state of Virginia, in the United States, which elected Danica Roem – the first transgender candidate elected to a state legislature in American history (CNN, 2019); and the publication by the Scottish government of legislation to reform the process of obtaining legal gender recognition (BBC News, 2019).

It is also imperative to recognize the advances made with transsexuality in Brazil (Grant, 2015) – despite the very timid way they occur. Public policies aimed specifically at transgender people² went through several stages and presented important modifications over time. In our country, we have some relevant examples, such as the publication of Resolution No. 1482 in 1997 by the Federal Council of Medicine (CFM). In this Resolution, sex reassignment surgery – which was prohibited in Brazil – was authorized for transsexual patients in the country on a therapeutic basis (Arán et al., 2009). We also have the publication of Ordinance No. 457 in 2008, which allowed the monitoring of cases of transsexuality and the performance of surgery by the SUS (*Sistema Único de Saúde* - Health Unic System - the Brazilian public health system). As well as more recent examples such as the ban on the use of the term transsexualism; the framing of LGBTQphobia in Law No. 7,716/89, which addresses crimes of prejudice and discrimination (Silva, 2019); the depathologization of trans identities by the World Health Organization (WHO), which officially adopted the International Classification of Diseases – 11th Revision (ICD-11)³ (Transgender Europe, 2019a);

¹The health card of the child, named Searyl Atli, was issued by the Government of British Columbia Province with the letter “U” in the space reserved for sex, which can be interpreted as undetermined (undetermined) or unassigned (not assigned) (Source: <http://www.bbc.com/portuguese/geral-40497693>).

²Transgender is an “umbrella” term associated with people whose self-identification or self-expression goes beyond socially established gender categories or boundaries, thus not limited to, but including, transsexuals, cross-dressers, and gender blenders (Grossman et al., 2005).

³In ICD-11, trans-related categories were removed from the chapter on Mental and Behavioral Disorders, meaning trans-identities are formally depsychopathological in ICD-11.

and the publication of Ordinance No. 1370 in 2019, according to which the SUS began to cover procedures related to the redesignation of the female phenotype to the male phenotype (such as vaginectomy and metoidioplasty).

Despite these meager achievements, the problems and difficulties faced by transsexual people remain, especially concerning issues that dehumanize and marginalize such individuals who discriminate and exclude them from society. Thus, the movement around creating public health policies does not include other basic themes that guarantee citizenship. For example, in Brazil, there is the possibility of changing the sex in the civil registry regardless of having surgery (Superior Tribunal de Justiça, 2017). However, even after going through all the bureaucratic steps of a judicial process, access to this right is dependent on a favorable outcome in the judgment. To get an idea of the issue entanglement, so far in the country, we only know about the case of a transgender child having been authorized to change their documents, which occurred in 2016 (Lemos, 2018).

The labor market faces a major crisis that has been particularly impacted worldwide by the Covid-19 pandemic when companies closed, and millions of people lost their jobs (Turon, 2021). According to data released by the IBGE (the main provider of geographic information and statistics in Brazil), the unemployment rate in the 4th quarter of 2020 was 13.9% (IBGE, 2021), and the country reached the record of the historical series started in the year of 2012 with 14.1 million unemployed people (Vassalo, 2021). Since the problems faced in the labor market by trans people exceed those by cis-gender people, considering that transphobia limits or denies them job opportunities (UFMG, 2020).

One of the biggest problems faced by trans people is LGBTQIAfobia, a hate crime against the LGBTQIA+ population whose conduct is unbailable and imprescriptible (Putti, 2019). In Brazil, this crime was only recognized by the Supreme Court in June 2019 (STF, 2019). Among members of the LGBTQIA+ population, transgender people are strongly affected by violence. The numbers of cases of assaults and deaths against transgender people are staggering. According to data from the Trans Murder Monitoring Project (Trans Murder Monitoring – TMM⁴) only in the period from October 2017 to September 2018, there were 369 cases of murders of transgender and diverse people. The majority of murders occurred in Brazil (with 167 cases), Mexico (71), the United States (28), and Colombia (21) (Transrespect, 2018). In 2020, there were registered a record number of murders against transvestites and trans women with 175 cases (ANTRA, 2021a).

Most trans people are in misery and social exclusion conditions without access to education, health, the labor market, and specific public policies (Nogueira, 2018).

⁴Project developed in April 2009 by TGEU (Transgender Europe) that conducts a systematic collection, monitoring, and analysis of murders reported by transgender variants around the world, as well as works to raise awareness about the extent of human rights violations committed against transgender people on a global scale. It was launched to fill the gap in the documentation of violence against transgender people (source: <https://tgeu.org/issues/violence-hate-speech/>).

4 An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion

Such exclusion and violence imply a sub-citizenship that reflects, for example, a life expectancy calculated at 35 years of age for trans people, less than half the Brazilian national average (Alves, 2018). Such a degree of exclusion is not exclusive to Brazil, since research in other countries, including those considered “developed,” register similar rates. Cochran et al. (2002) indicate that, when transgender youth are more likely to be rejected by their families, they are more likely to live on the streets and commit suicide than other populations (including nontrans homeless people).

We understand that the theme of transsexuality still represents an arena full of power disputes in which the parties sometimes take antagonistic positions. On the one hand, we have actors seeking to advance in discussions on this topic; on the other hand, we have a rescue of ideologies that promote the reopening of deep wounds and arising from a violent period for the LGBTQIA+ community. In order to understand the dichotomy *advances* and *setbacks* in relation to the inclusion of trans people in the labor market, it is essential to look to the past and analyze the trajectory of a certain event or historical landmark, tracing the sociopolitical trajectory actors, as this allows us to understand the constitution of pasts that acted in the maintenance and even the legitimization of gender relations in the now (Hartt et al., 2017).

One of the examples of something that today is considered a great historical mark for transsexuality in Brazil occurred, surprisingly, during the *tenebrous time* of the Brazilian dictatorial regime (Memórias da Ditadura, 2019). The first sex reassignment surgery of a transsexual woman in Brazil took place in 1971. This medical procedure which happened at the *Hospital das Clínicas* of the Faculty of Medicine of USP (University of São Paulo) – already recognized at the time as a reference hospital in several specialties and linked to one of the main medicine schools of the country – and after five years of its realization it has become a judicial court case. Since, in 1976, the Public Ministry of São Paulo accused the doctor responsible for the surgery of the crime of bodily injury (Ministério Público do Estado de São Paulo, 1976) and considered the patient a victim by default (Luna & Barros, 2021). The surgery that was initially celebrated as a successful case of medicine in Brazil – considering its high complexity – suffered a sudden turn and was identified as a crime. In 1978, the doctor was sentenced to two years of imprisonment in the first instance, having been cleared of the prosecution only after appealing the decision in the second instance (Rossi, 2018). This judicial process was later used for purposes of legal basis in other similar cases as well as in processes to change the civil registry (Ministério Público do Estado de São Paulo, 1976) and is currently considered by the São Paulo Court of Justice itself as a historical document (found at random and transformed into part of an exhibition⁵ alongside 28 other processes, among which, the 1924 Revolution and the known Red-Light Bandit case) (TJSP, 2017).

⁵The TJSP collection was damaged after a flood and, during the restoration of the affected documents, the surgery lawsuit was identified, classified as historical, and included as part of the exhibition called “From Paper to the Digital Era.” In this exhibition were

This case represented an important moment for transsexuality in Brazil – specifically in sex reassignment surgery – but it was not the only one, as other events were also fundamental for this trajectory. In this way, we understand that within each trajectory, we have several occurrences that represent turning points that left a mark, changed the understanding of transsexuality in Brazilian society including significant changes regarding the intelligibility of transsexuality in organizations.

Based on this, we were able to recognize that turning points occur through constant articulations and movements between multiple hybrid actors, among which are people, laws, norms, events, organizations, and other actors that influenced the understanding of a social past. In this research, it is considered that such movements reflect in mobilizations (with the unification of discourse, thought, or action) and demobilizations (which result in silencing, removals, or exclusions) of actors or networks of actors who influenced trans employability issues among other aspects. In this sense, we still understand that these turning points can be perceived as other narratives that are inserted, embedded, contained by this broader and more visible trajectory where the *longer* history ends up making, the smaller ones invisible – *hiding* in a black box individual elements and processes through their unification (Latour, 1987).

The trajectory of trans employability is a complex issue composed of several facets and encompassing social, political, health, legal, and labor dimensions. Moreover, this trajectory is not an isolated issue but is intertwined with narratives in a broader context such as (a) transsexuality as a psychiatric disorder; (b) first sex reassignment surgery (as well as the history of how a medical procedure became a court case and even later was designated a historical document); and (c) transsexuality assuming a space among public health policies.

As stated earlier in this research, we adopted a historical perspective as we infer that it allows us a different look to understand contemporary events, which is not only informed by what happened in the immediate past but which can inform such occurrences and also our current condition (Durepos, 2009). In developing our argument with a focus on the performance of the past and its problematics, we turn to ANTi-History (Durepos, 2009), an approach developed in the area of Management and Organizational Studies (MOS) that allows us to understand the phenomenon through a unique and retrospective lens. Through ANTi-History, we can analyze the sociopolitical trajectory of trans employability in Brazil as one of the multiple ways of creating knowledge about its past following the traces left by the networks that acted in it (Durepos, 2009; Myrick et al., 2013).

ANTi-History assumes that the construction of history can be understood through the sociopolitics of networks of actors. Therefore, by following the sociopolitics of these networks, it becomes possible to expose the interests of the networks of actors involved in the construction of history. In other words, we

displayed information and images of 29 processes selected by the Document Management Program of the Secretariat of First Instance, whose cases are related to historical and legal facts that guided the country's course (Luna & Barros, 2021).

chose to look at the phenomenon through a historical approach informed by the actor-network theory (Callon, 1986; Latour, 1987; Law, 1986). Then, we understand that all these issues raised so far involve different levels of force (power of influence) driven by different actors (human and nonhuman) who have partial and distinct perspectives on the past.

Thus, the present study seeks to investigate the sociopolitical relations of actors-network, highlighting the major mobilizations and demobilizations in the trajectory of employability of transgender people in organizations in Brazil (re)assembling a version of history. Since such ordering of traces results in a socio-past version that enabled the current adoption of actions and policies for the insertion of trans people in the labor market. For this, a critical, procedural, relational, and practical lens will be adopted: the theoretical–methodological approach ANTi-History (Durepos, 2009; Durepos & Mills, 2012, 2017).

In short, based on assumptions mentioned above, this work argues that (re)assembling a past version of the trajectory of employability of transgender people – analyzing the different hybrid actors in the continuous organization of translation networks – we understand its social construction, and we can from that mobilize agents who work in the maintenance and legitimization of the existing relationships in this phenomenon. In other words, our core argument is that recent initiatives to include trans people in the labor market are not ahistorical. The version of the history we tell reveals a network composed of complex layers that involve numerous actors. Thus, by looking at this phenomenon through a retrospective lens and showing some of the movements and silencing, organizations can expand the possibility of acting more efficiently in the present moment.

Research Relevance and Contributions

As previously pointed out, this research uses a historical, theoretical lens that is considered recent in the field of administration, the ANTi-History (Durepos, 2009; Durepos & Mills, 2012). One of the reasons for this choice was that through ANTi-History – which is informed by the Actor-Network Theory (Latour, 1987) – it is possible to analyze the sociopolitical trajectory of transsexuality in Brazil as one of the multiple forms of creation of knowledge about its past, following the traces left by the actor-networks who are part of it (Durepos, 2009; Myrick et al., 2013). The relevance of using ANTi-History in MOS is also present with regard to the call for the historical turn in the area (Booth & Rowlinson, 2006) as it responds to this invitation through (a) critical reflection and academic researcher's reflexivity; (b) questioning the false necessity or assumed naturalness of organizations and theories of an organization; (c) fusion of business history and historical theory; (d) transparency regarding its epistemological and ontological assumptions; (e) satisfaction of the need for philosophically transparent knowledge; (f) mainly, development of an alternative way of writing (Durepos, 2009).

Gabrielle Durepos elaborated the theoretical–methodological approach in question in her doctoral thesis under Professor Albert J. Mills's supervision (Durepos, 2009). Despite its important contribution to the area, more than a decade after its creation, research using ANTi-History in MOS is still scarce

(Durepos & Mills, 2012, 2017; Hartt et al., 2014; Ipiranga et al., 2016; Myrick et al., 2013; Quelha-de-Sá & Costa, 2018). Nevertheless, historical analyses can feed an emancipatory management research program by developing content that changes class consciousness, enhances self-knowledge, and helps to raise awareness of social, ideological, environmental, and economic constraints, serving to influence, educate, and create awareness about marginalized groups (Durepos et al., 2019).

Furthermore, at some level, this research expects to make a methodological contribution for ANTi-historians. Since commonly, ANTi-History studies present a certain point of centrality in the network around which the research is built, which is limited to a specific institution or physical space. For example, in her doctoral thesis, Durepos (2009) exemplifies the use of his approach to understanding the history of a specific organization (Pan American Airways), and Quelha-de-Sá (2018) builds in her master's thesis a narrative around an organization located in a physical space the *Memorial da Resistência* (Resistance Memorial) in São Paulo. This research takes a path that differs from those ANTi-History studies on which it is based, especially when it does not focus on a specific institution, physical space, or establishment. Nonetheless deals with a past inherent to a social collective and various organizations of different natures. In short, the process of following the network led to different collections, the surveys took on some particularities, a mapping of recent and ongoing history was carried out, bringing network actors of more current inclusion policies, actions, and initiatives in addition to understanding and use of tools aimed at diagramming networks. As a result, some needs arose throughout the process, and the choice and adoption of methodological procedures had to be adapted to resolve some issues (explained in the inherent chapter), understanding that such solutions can be used in research with a similar object.

In gender studies, this study can contribute to discussing transsexuality – which despite not being a recent topic in academia (being addressed by different areas such as health, communication, law, and bioethics), its discussion expanded Organizational Studies. Although academic production on trans living has increased and, as pointed out by O'Shea (2020), there is a growing body of work in management and related areas that focuses on the experience of trans people at work (Connell, 2010; Knights & Thanem, 2011; Muhr & Sullivan, 2013; Schilt, 2006; Schilt & Connell, 2007), transgender issues are still a minority and receive little attention in MOS (Thanem & Wallenberg, 2016). Few studies bring this theme to the discussion addressing, for example, labor relations (Carrieri et al., 2014; Kaffer et al., 2016; Licciardi et al., 2015; Pizzi et al., 2017); the management of diversity (Lima & Albuquerque, 2017); and prejudice in organizations (Cândido, 2016).

Also, as well as Ciprikis et al. (2020), we understand that the results of this study present important elements to help policy interventions, raise awareness and encourage employers to adopt fairer and more inclusive management practices that promote an improvement in the labor market for trans people. Furthermore, we hope to contribute to the managerial aspect of organizations, as there is a possibility of integrating their content with a practical vision, for example:

(a) in the implementation of inclusion policies in the formal labor market (in areas such as responsibility corporate social, people management, and brand management); and (b) in technical production with the development of material aimed at internal communication and the offer of informative courses for management.

Research Delimitation

In addition to the relevance and the complexity, and variety of possible designs that this study could take, it is worth highlighting aspects that delimit it. The research phenomenon is the sociopolitical trajectory of actions and initiatives related to the employability of transgender people in organizations in Brazil. The focus is on analyzing sociopolitical relations between actors-network, contemplating the identification of its mobilizations and demobilizations, and mapping of central hybrid actors (human or nonhuman) whose involvement has been delineated through the traces found in the main turning points of this trajectory.

The term “mobilization” can take on some interpretations and especially be related to social movements. Thereby it is worth mentioning that in this research, the terms mobilizations or demobilizations are used to refer to movements of multiple network-actors that could promote a discourse strengthening/silencing (respectively), a unification/removal of actors around a thought, or an articulation/exclusion of some actions and places. As mentioned above, network actors comprise hybrid actors, human and nonhuman, which, although encompassing, is not limited to actions of social movements or collectives.

Given the length and complexity of the temporal and geographic space related to the scope of this study, it is also important to clarify that it does not intend to exhaust the identification of the network actors involved in the observed trajectory. In addition to the unfeasibility of an analysis that (i) identifies all network-actors and reassembles all the relationships involved in the trajectory of employability of trans people, (ii) incorporates a temporal retrospect that exceeds 50 years, (iii) covers the entire length of a country like Brazil observing regional specificities, the result of which would be exhausting to follow and unnecessary for this research.

This research intends to reassemble a version of the social past that makes it possible to demonstrate how some movements that occurred over time changed relevant aspects of the social-political trajectory of the employability of trans people in Brazil. Also, during this (re)assembly process, there is an effort to identify and unveil the network-actors’ relations that appear in relevant movements or turning points.

Added to this, it is worth pointing out that when outlining general aspects related to the phenomenon observed, it is not the responsibility of this study to permeate topics of public management, public health, or transsexuality that go beyond these aspects, nor go into individual experiences. These topics have indisputable relevance; however, each requires a level of depth that would provide several other discussions and future productions.

With the use of ANTi-History (due to its ontologically amodern and relational character), this research renounces categorizations imposed by modern